

# ACCELERATING TRANSITION TO A ZERO CARBON FUTURE: AN INITIAL MAPPING OF POTENTIAL ACTIVITIES

## Introduction

- 1 This note is intended to contribute to Zero West’s analysis of how to achieve large-scale effective change, including helping to build and sustain a community of action<sup>1</sup>. It draws on the research literature and discussion within Zero West to undertake an initial mapping of potential activities, and to make suggestions about a potential way forward<sup>2</sup>.
- 2 The research literature highlights that there is no singular roadmap or blueprint for accelerating transitions, but that this is more likely to happen when:
  - initiatives are taken across a range of scales (eg local, city-region and national) and involving a range of key institutions and organisations (business, local government, the public sector and community groups);
  - working to broad but linked agendas across sectors (eg energy, transport, housing and food); and
  - building alliances as appropriate to the objectives of an activity<sup>3</sup>.

Organisations addressing these ingredients for accelerating transitions are often categorised as ‘intermediaries’, with roles that include: knowledge exchange; instigating, facilitating, brokering and enabling activities; and building and sustaining networks<sup>4</sup>. Research also shows that when social justice is embedded into sustainability transitions, strong support can be generated.<sup>5</sup>

- 3 Taking into account the outputs of Zero West meetings<sup>6</sup>, this note maps the potential activities across which Zero West might fulfil these sorts of roles. The purpose of the mapping is to help inform judgements about how Zero West might add most value to the plethora of existing energy-related activities in the West of England, thereby enabling it to identify and agree the potential scope of its activities. This is far from straightforward given the substantial number and type of groups and organisations that are active across these scales and sectors. As part of the initial mapping of potential activities, the note outlines which stakeholders already have

---

<sup>1</sup> Burohappold Engineering, ‘Defining Zero West’, presentation to the Zero West meeting, 24 February 2017.

<sup>2</sup> The note has been prepared by a researcher at the Schumacher Institute, which is an independent, Bristol based, think tank that studies the economic, social and environmental challenges faced by the planet and its people, <http://www.schumacherinstitute.org.uk/>. The author, Fred Barker, is a Senior Research Fellow at TSI.

<sup>3</sup> See, for example, I Scoones et al (Ed), ‘The Politics of Green Transformations’, Earthscan, 2015 or H Schmitz and I Scoones, ‘Accelerating Sustainability: Why Political Economy Matters’, Institute of Development Studies, Sept 2015, <https://www.ids.ac.uk/publication/accelerating-sustainability-why-political-economy-matters>. The recent report from the Centre for Alternative Technology, ‘Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen’, 2017, draws similar conclusions about accelerating the transition, <http://zerocarbonbritain.org/en/>.

<sup>4</sup> See in particular the Bristol-based case study in C Bird and J Barnes, ‘Scaling up community activism: the role of intermediaries in collective approaches to community energy’, People Place and Policy, 8/3, 2014, pp. 208-221 (<http://extra.shu.ac.uk/ppp-online/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/scaling-up-community-activism.pdf>), and T Hargreaves et al, ‘Grassroots innovations in community energy: the role of intermediaries in niche development’, Global Environmental Change 23, 2013, p868–880.

<sup>5</sup> See in particular Julian Agyeman’s work on Just Sustainabilites <http://julianagyeman.com/2012/09/just-sustainabilites/>.

<sup>6</sup> See, in particular, the outcome of the meeting on 2 December 2016, <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B9VYhGL5uLpsZ3Rhdm1ZTlmRkU/view>.

an interest and role in those activities, and suggests questions which could be discussed with them to inform judgements about the scope of Zero West activities and how it might add most value.

- 4 In order to give structure to the initial mapping this note uses a framework drawn from the research literature. This framework categorises activities in terms of whether the activity contributes to ‘scaling up, scaling out, or scaling deep’<sup>7</sup>. For potential Zero West activities, these categories can be defined as follows:

- **Scaling up** – focuses on activities to increase the scale of investment in renewable energy, energy efficiency and decarbonisation across the West of England, and to influence institutions at the city region level or above;
- **Scaling out** – focuses on activities to increase grassroots activity within the West of England;
- **Scaling deep** – focuses on activities that contribute to culturally embedding a narrative of positive change to a zero carbon future.

In principle, being able to take appropriate initiatives across all three types of activity should enhance the prospects of accelerating transition.

- 5 Using this framework, the note covers the following:

- an initial mapping of potential **scaling up** activities;
- an initial mapping of potential **scaling out** activities;
- an initial mapping of potential **scaling deep** activities;
- a potential approach to identifying and agreeing the scope of Zero West activities; and
- a table summarising the initial mapping, key questions and stakeholders.

## Initial Mapping of Potential Activities: Scaling Up

- 6 There are, in principle, a range of activities that could increase the scale of investment in renewable energy, energy efficiency and decarbonisation across the West of England, and influence institutions at the city region level or above. These are outlined below, along with questions that could be addressed when discussing how Zero West might add most value:

- a) **Enabling investment in projects** - What are the main foreseeable opportunities for further investment in renewable energy, energy efficiency or decarbonisation projects within the West of England<sup>8</sup>? In principle, there could be different types of investment project, including at large scale (eg revisiting off-shore wind - the Atlantic Array), widely replicated

---

<sup>7</sup> M L Moore et al, ‘Scaling Out, Scaling Up, Scaling Deep Strategies of Non-profits in Advancing Systemic Social Innovation’, Journal of Corporate Citizenship Issue 58, June 2015. The typology was developed through discussion in a ‘community of practice’, involving researchers working with foundation grant recipients to identify activities contributing most effectively to transformative change.

<sup>8</sup> The Zero West New Projects working group has begun to answer this question. There are a range of analyses that could help inform further consideration of this question. See, for example: the overview of West of England renewable energy installed capacity compared with potential capacity (Table 7.5) in [http://mol-lymep.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/The-power-to-transform-the-South-West\\_FINAL1.pdf](http://mol-lymep.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/The-power-to-transform-the-South-West_FINAL1.pdf); the review of the cost and effectiveness of low carbon options, and the scope for their deployment, in Bristol <http://bristol.ac.uk/cabot/media/documents/bristol-low-carbon-cities-report.pdf>; and the range of technical and institutional proposals for enabling the expansion of distributed forms of energy generation in [https://www.academia.edu/11371258/Distributing\\_power\\_A\\_transition\\_to\\_a\\_civic\\_energy\\_sector](https://www.academia.edu/11371258/Distributing_power_A_transition_to_a_civic_energy_sector).

(eg PVs on commercial/industrial properties), across sectors (eg PVs on social housing, or large-scale community retrofits) or innovatory projects (eg around smart grids and peer-to-peer supply – see also para 7e). For investments at large scale, could Zero West play a role in enabling investment, for example, by brokering and managing partnerships between community energy groups or with commercial companies, or by seeking to access specific forms of finance (eg pension funds<sup>9</sup>)? How could Zero West's role most effectively complement and add to those already active in this area (including Low Carbon SW<sup>10</sup>, Mongoose Energy<sup>11</sup> and Regen SW<sup>12</sup>)? And which other organisations should be involved in discussions to explore possibilities (eg Western Power Distribution<sup>13</sup>, the Energy Systems Catapult<sup>14</sup>, Bristol is Open<sup>15</sup>, local university specialists, West of England LEP and Bristol Energy)?

- b) **Influencing the West of England Combined Authority (WECA)**<sup>16</sup> – WECA has a range of relevant powers and functions, including transport, housing, skills and strategic planning<sup>17</sup>. It is therefore important to ask what the new combined authority could do to contribute to achieving a zero carbon future? There are various factors to take into account: in particular, how might WECA build on and complement the existing work of

<sup>9</sup> See, for example, discussion in S Spratt, 'Financing Green Transformations', p160 (in I Scoones et al, 'The Politics of Green Transformations', Earthscan 2015), and the Nottinghamshire Pension Fund PV investment example in CAT, 'Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen', p235, 2017, <http://zerocarbonbritain.org/en/>. Zero West could also consider how to support initiatives on the development of local banking in Bristol and the West of England.

<sup>10</sup> Low Carbon SW is a Community Interest Company seeking to help grow a prosperous and resilient low carbon economy for the region, by supporting and promoting businesses, and networking with academia, local authorities, SMEs and multi-nationals with a presence in the area. For further information see <https://www.lowcarbonsouthwest.co.uk/what-we-do/>.

<sup>11</sup> Mongoose Energy works to bring together local people and commercial developers to identify, develop, finance, build and manage community-owned, clean energy projects. It is majority owned by its community partners which include Bath and West Community Energy, Bristol Energy Co-operative and Low Carbon Gordano. For further information see <http://mongooseenergy.coop/>.

<sup>12</sup> Regen SW is an independent not for profit that works with industry, communities and the public sector to get cutting edge sustainable energy projects off the ground (covering energy generation, supply and use). See <https://www.regensw.co.uk/>.

<sup>13</sup> Western Power Distribution has a range of innovation projects related to low carbon networks and smart grids, and states that it welcomes ideas and suggestions from stakeholders. See WPD's innovation strategy at <https://www.westernpower.co.uk/docs/Innovation-and-Low-Carbon/Innovation-Strategy-Final.aspx>. Examples have included SoLa Bristol and the Wadebridge Sunshine Tariff, see 'Rough Guide to Engaging Communities in Energy Network Innovation', ENA/Regen SW, 2016, <https://www.regensw.co.uk/rough-guide-to-engaging-communities-in-energy-network-innovation>. See also para 8c in this paper.

<sup>14</sup> The Energy Systems Catapult is one of a network of elite technology and innovation centres set up by Innovate UK. It seeks to help the UK navigate the transformation of the energy system and capture the new commercial opportunities created (covering electricity, heat and combustible gases). For further information see <https://es.catapult.org.uk/>.

<sup>15</sup> Bristol Is Open is a joint venture between the University of Bristol and Bristol City Council, delivering research and development initiatives that contribute to the development of a smart city and the 'Internet of Things', and focusing on information provision about key aspects of city life, including energy, air quality and traffic flows. See <http://www.bristolisopen.com/overview/>. For a roadmap to developing a smart energy city, see 'Bristol Smart Energy City: Mapping a Path for Bristol', Bristol Smart Energy Collaboration, CSE, December 2015, <https://www.cse.org.uk/downloads/reports-and-publications/policy/community-energy/insulation-and-heating/planning/renewables/towards-a-smart-energy-city-mapping-path-for-bristol.pdf>.

<sup>16</sup> <https://www.westofengland-ca.org.uk/>.

<sup>17</sup> See for example the guide to the WECA's powers, functions and duties at [https://www.businesswest.co.uk/sites/default/files/a\\_guide\\_to\\_devolution\\_metro\\_mayors\\_the\\_west\\_of\\_england\\_reduced\\_size.pdf](https://www.businesswest.co.uk/sites/default/files/a_guide_to_devolution_metro_mayors_the_west_of_england_reduced_size.pdf).

the unitary authorities? WECA will also be working closely with the Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP) - what role and influence should WECA have on the LEP's Low Carbon strategy<sup>18</sup>? Looking more widely, what lessons might be learnt from the approach of other combined authorities that are taking up the carbon challenge<sup>19</sup>? And how might Zero West work most effectively with WECA – for example, are there specific activities and projects that Zero West might look to WECA to support<sup>20</sup>? Finally, given the importance of transport, buildings and food sectors<sup>21</sup> to carbon emissions, who else should Zero West seek to involve and work with in seeking to influence WECA (eg Sustrans on transport)?

- c) **Influencing the West of England LEP** – the LEP's strategic plan includes a low carbon objective (about ensuring a resilient low carbon economy operating within environmental limits), has low carbon as one of five priority sectors, and is overseeing a series of low carbon schemes (including solar, retrofit schemes and a feasibility study to explore opportunities to harness low carbon energy in the Severn Estuary)<sup>22</sup>. In addition to the question about its future relationship with WECA (above), it is important to ask how Zero West might seek to relate to, or influence, the LEP's low carbon programme? For example, could there be specific projects that Zero West might look to the LEP or its members to develop and support in the future<sup>23</sup>?
- d) **Destabilising Fossil Fuels** – the research literature highlights the importance of 'destabilising' existing regimes alongside work to promote desired transitions, on the grounds that this helps overcome 'carbon lock-in' and creates the space for transitions to take place<sup>24</sup>. The growing international campaign to get universities, cities, religious institutions and others to divest pension and other funds from the fossil fuel industry is a great example<sup>25</sup>. Are there ways in which Zero West can support divestment campaigns

---

<sup>18</sup> The LEP's Low Carbon strategy and programme is set out in <http://www.westofenglandlep.co.uk/about-us/strategicplan>.

<sup>19</sup> For example, the Greater Manchester Combined Authority has a 'Climate Change and Low Emissions Implementation Plan', a Low-Carbon Hub and a Project Delivery Unit. See [https://www.greatermanchester-ca.gov.uk/info/20005/low\\_carbon](https://www.greatermanchester-ca.gov.uk/info/20005/low_carbon). See also the IPPR's proposals in 'Commit to Achieving a Zero Carbon London by 2050', November 2015, <http://www.ippr.org/publications/zero-carbon-london>.

<sup>20</sup> The Zero West New Projects group has suggested a range of energy, transport and housing projects that could be discussed with WECA.

<sup>21</sup> In 'Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen' CAT argue that the four key sectors where transition needs to happen are transport, buildings, food and energy. CAT highlight that there is a need to eliminate carbon emissions from driving and flying, substantially reduce emissions from livestock and soils, and achieve a large-scale reduction in energy demand from buildings, along with a switch away from fossil fuel powered heating systems.

<sup>22</sup> See <http://www.westofenglandlep.co.uk/about-us/strategicplan> p36-37 and p42-43.

<sup>23</sup> See, for example, the range of technical and institutional proposals for enabling the expansion of distributed forms of energy generation in J Barton et al, 'Distributing Power: A transition to a civic energy future', Report of the Realising Transition Pathways Research Consortium 'Engine Room', led by Bath University, [https://www.academia.edu/11371258/Distributing\\_power\\_A\\_transition\\_to\\_a\\_civic\\_energy\\_sector](https://www.academia.edu/11371258/Distributing_power_A_transition_to_a_civic_energy_sector). See also the suggestions from the Zero West New Projects working group.

<sup>24</sup> I Scoones et al, 'The Politics of Green Transformations', Earthscan 2015, p21 and 77-81, B Turnheim and F Geels, 'The destabilisation of existing regimes: Confronting a multi-dimensional framework with a case study of the British coal industry (1913–1967)', Research Policy 42, 2013, p1749– 1767, and A Klitkou, 'The role of lock-in mechanisms in transition processes: the case of energy for road transport', Environmental Innovation and Societal Transition, Vol 16, 2015, p22-37.

<sup>25</sup> See <https://gofossilfree.org/uk/about/> and <https://www.facebook.com/FossilFreeBristol/>.

aimed at bodies at the city region or above, or develop or support other initiatives to help overcome 'carbon lock-in'<sup>26</sup>?

- e) **Working with trade unions** – it is widely recognised that a transition to a zero carbon future would entail substantial economic restructuring with winners and losers amongst workforces and local communities. The TUC and leading NGO's have therefore argued that there needs to be a 'just transition', with a focus on consultation, investment in new jobs, skills and technologies, and social protection for citizens caught up in change<sup>27</sup>. These activities could be viewed as essential to enabling an accelerated transition. Should Zero West seek to involve and work with regional trade unions in the West of England on steps towards a just transition? Could alliances be formed to identify and work on joint initiatives? Is there potential to involve specialist skills centres in the region<sup>28</sup>?

## Initial Mapping of Potential Activities: Scaling Out

- 7 There are, in principle, a range of activities that could be undertaken to increase grassroots activity within the West of England. This could be important for a number of reasons, including to build constituencies of local support, to empower local people to take action in their communities, and to find ways of enabling more local communities to reduce energy demand and generate renewable energy. Examples of potential activities include:
- a) **Working with organisations with a linked agenda** – to what extent, and in what ways, should Zero West seek to work with organisations that are already active on transport, buildings and food to help increase grassroots activity on decarbonisation? The research literature on green transformations highlights the importance of developing alliances where there is an alignment of interests so that joint initiatives can be taken, either as a one-off, for the short-term or for more enduring activities<sup>29</sup>.
- b) **Working with organisations on decarbonisation and social justice** – should Zero West seek to build on and spread the sort of initiatives that the Bristol Energy Network has undertaken to help create 'just sustainability' alliances? This has included, for example, working with money and debt advisory organisations (Talking Money and Pennywise) to support people in fuel poverty, working with the Green and Black Ambassadors<sup>30</sup> scheme to increase diversity in the community energy sector, and working with a tenants union (ACORN) to address the quality of housing in the private rented sector. Such alliances can be strengthened and deepened into long term working relationships, leading to further opportunities for collaboration.

<sup>26</sup> In 'Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen' CAT suggest looking at ways in which the undue influence of vested interests can be challenged eg through seeking amendments to the law on transparency of lobbying and introducing rules to prevent 'revolving doors' between fossil fuel companies and Government.

<sup>27</sup> TUC and Greenpeace, 'Green Collar Nation: a Just Transition to a Low Carbon Economy', October 2016, <https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/GreenCollarNation.pdf>.

<sup>28</sup> See, in particular, the Gloucestershire Renewable Energy, Engineering & Nuclear Skills Project (a specialist training centre for the provision of the jobs needed for the supply chain for major engineering projects and the low-carbon industry) <http://www.gfirstlep.com/Projects-in-Gloucestershire/GREEN/>, and the Construction and Engineering Centre of Excellence (CECE) at Weston College <https://www.weston.ac.uk/why-choose-us/campuses-and-facilities/construction-and-engineering-centre-excellence>.

<sup>29</sup> See, for example, H Schmitz, 'Green Transformation: is there a fast track?', Ch 11 in I Scoones et al (Ed), 'The Politics of Green Transformations', 2015, Earthscan.

<sup>30</sup> The Green and Black ambassadors is a pilot initiative from October 2016 that seeks to address exclusion of Black and Minority Ethnic communities in Bristol's environmental sustainability initiatives. See <http://www.bristol.ac.uk/cabot/research/green-and-black/ambassadors/>

- c) **Helping to create more community energy groups** – could the experience and expertise within Zero West be used to help establish community energy groups in locales within the West of England where there is currently little energy related activity? How does this possibility relate to suggestions about people and place-based engagement under potential scaling deep activities (see para 8a below)?
- d) **Connecting and supporting community energy groups** - is there a role for Zero West in providing an information and learning exchange, in mentoring groups and facilitating mutual aid between groups, or developing a training network<sup>31</sup>? If so, how would this relate to and build on the work of the Bristol Energy Network<sup>32</sup>, Mongoose Energy, Regen SW and Community Energy England<sup>33</sup>?
- e) **Helping to spread grassroots energy innovations** – is there a role for Zero West to keep abreast of promising or successful innovatory ideas and activities from community groups and local authorities outside the West of England, so that these could be trialled or applied in the city region<sup>34</sup>? If so, how can this monitoring role be most effectively undertaken?

## Initial Mapping of Potential Activities: Scaling Deep

8 The research literature, and the experience of those working in the field, suggest specific approaches for effectively scaling deep (ie for culturally embedding a narrative of positive change). These include:

- a) **Generating support for, or consent to, the transition to a zero carbon future through people and place-based engagement** – given the scale and nature of the changes involved, Zero West participant Simon Roberts has recently stressed the importance of generating meaningful public consent for the transition to a zero carbon future<sup>35</sup>. Pointing to the example of on-shore wind, Simon highlights how the absence of local consent is

---

<sup>31</sup> It has been argued that these are key roles for ‘intermediaries’. See the Bristol-based case study in C Bird and J Barnes, ‘Scaling up community activism: the role of intermediaries in collective approaches to community energy’, *People Place and Policy*, 8/3, 2014, pp. 208-221, and T Hargreaves et al, ‘Grassroots innovations in community energy: the role of intermediaries in niche development’, *Global Environmental Change* 23, 2013, p868–880. See also the discussion in CAT’s ‘Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen’, p186-188.

<sup>32</sup> See, ‘Bristol Community Strategy for Energy’, 2013, developed through the Bristol Energy Network, <http://bristolenergynetwork.org/legacy/strategy/> and various intermediaries, including Bristol University, Bristol City Council and the CSE (see C Bird and J Barnes as referenced above). BEN’s activities have also included working with the Green and Black Ambassadors scheme to increase the minority ethnic representation in the community energy sector.

<sup>33</sup> <http://communityenergyengland.org/>.

<sup>34</sup> In ‘Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen’, for example, CAT point to new energy supply models that are being trialled (p221-2), including an initiative by ‘Energy Local’, working with Community Energy Wales, who are developing a ‘farmers market’ for electricity that would allow communities to buy electricity directly from local renewable suppliers. See also, ‘A Glimpse into the Future of Britain’s Energy Economy’, Open Utility 2016, on the findings of the Cornwall Piclo trial, which claims to be Britain’s first on-line peer-to-peer market place for renewable energy, <https://piclo.uk/>.

<sup>35</sup> S Roberts, ‘Towards meaningful public consent for action to cut UK emissions’, Stimulus paper for Engaging the public on emissions reduction Roundtable, 20 February 2017, <https://www.cse.org.uk/downloads/reports-and-publications/policy/renewables/Towards-meaningful-public-consent-for-action-to-cut-UK-emissions-CIFF-stimulus-paper.pdf>. See also, ‘A smart flexible energy system: call for evidence’, CSE’s response to BEIS/Ofgem call for evidence, January 2017, <https://www.cse.org.uk/downloads/file/CSE-response-smart-flexible-energy-system-consultation-jan-2017.pdf>.

likely to risk the success of transition. An important observation is that ‘latent consent’ often already exists, as many people have a sense that energy system change is needed, driven by a need to cut carbon emissions. The key thing is to activate this consent, not quash it. Based on CSE’s experience with PlanLocal and Future Energy Landscapes, Simon argues that the most effective way of activating consent is to enable local people to participate in meaningful discussions about what they value, and about options and choices for contributing to change, before being involved meaningfully in decisions about local developments. A key challenge is how to expand and replicate this approach in a timely way across many locales, raising questions about whether positive results can be achieved with less external input, and about how to build a pool of people with the skills and knowledge to run sessions. This leads to a number of questions that Zero West and partners might consider. In particular, is there a role for Zero West in developing a programme of people and place centred engagement (or working with others undertaking such engagement to seek to ensure energy issues are addressed)? Could Zero West play a part in developing a network of suitable engagement facilitators? And what are the implications of this engagement approach for how Zero West partners might go about any substantive renewable energy development in the future?

- b) **Generating support for, or consent to, the transition to a zero carbon future through engaging with self-transcendent values** – Corner and colleagues at Climate Outreach<sup>36</sup> have reviewed research that shows how our values influence how we interpret climate change information to either accept or reject the need for greater engagement and action (including behaviour change). This research identifies categories of values that include self-enhancing and self-transcendent values. Corner and colleagues point out that very few individuals hold only one set of values entirely at the expense of the other, and that under certain conditions individuals leading consumerist lifestyles have been shown to identify with and be receptive to messages framed using self-transcendent values. Critical, therefore, is the extent to which particular values are activated and primed by communications<sup>37</sup>. Corner and colleagues argue that the challenge for climate change communicators is to identify ways of bridging between the diverse values that any given group

---

<sup>36</sup> A Corner et al, ‘Public engagement with climate change: the role of human values’, *WIREs Climate Change* 2014, 5:411–422, doi: 10.1002/wcc.269. Climate Outreach are specialist climate change communicators that seek to bridge the gap between research and practice and widen engagement across a broader spectrum of society. See <http://climateoutreach.org/purpose/>.

<sup>37</sup> Corner and colleagues argue there have been two primary trends in values-based climate change campaigning: firstly, to promote messages primarily oriented towards self-transcendent values; and secondly, to identify the values that target populations actually hold and try to match campaign messages to those values (a strategy known as ‘social marketing’). One unintended result of the first trend is that public engagement with climate change has become polarized along values-based lines: people that hold strongly self-transcendent values have come to view climate change as a serious problem requiring immediate action, while those who more strongly endorse self-enhancement values have come to view action on climate change as an (implicit) attack on their values, and something that should only be pursued if it is in their individual self-interest. Corner and colleagues point out that a more recent trend for ‘social marketing’ has been successful in promoting some limited changes in pro-environmental behaviours, but that it can lead to paradoxical situations whereby values known to be incongruent with action on climate change (e.g. materialism) are used as the basis of campaigns to engage the public. This has led some to argue that ‘social marketing’ campaigns that focus on self-enhancing values undermine the ‘common cause’ and are incongruent with securing a sustainable future. See, for example, T Crompton from the Common Cause Foundation, ‘Values Matter’, in CAT, ‘Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen’, p145-148. Similarly, K Raworth points to research which suggests that the most effective approach to creating deep and lasting social and ecological behaviour change is to connect with people’s values, see ‘Tapping into nudge, networks and norms’, p123-126, in ‘Doughnut Economics’, Random House, 2017.

of individuals holds and the values that are congruent with a more sustainable society. They suggest that focusing on concerns, for example, about public health (eg air pollution), community well-being, intergenerational duty or security can activate self-transcending values in those often motivated by self-enhancing values. This view has been underpinned by more recent research looking at centre-right perspectives in the post-Brexit landscape<sup>38</sup>. The research authors makes a series of recommendations about how to engage those with centre-right views, including: using messaging around human relationships (eg ‘we are all in this together’ and ‘everyone is doing their bit’); presenting change as continuations of previous familiar and accepted improvements in people’s lives; making climate messages tangible and meaningful; positioning clean energy as a responsibility and duty to future generations; focusing on the importance of maintaining a balance; and being humble about claims for renewables. Finally, Corner and colleagues note the evidence that deliberative engagement processes are likely to be more effective than one-way message oriented communications. How might Zero West take account of these research findings when developing its public outreach activities? For example, in addition to mobilising those with strongly self-transcending values to action, should Zero West consider developing a programme of talks and discussions with groups where a significant proportion of members might be more inclined to hold centre-right or self-enhancing values?

- c) **Generating support for, or consent to, the transition to a zero carbon future through telling culturally diverse narratives of sustainable social practices** – for example, the Akashi project in Cambridge gathered stories from elders in BME communities regarding sustainable daily life practices, making visible the way that sustainability has a long history in many cultures, not just among white ‘environmentalists’<sup>39</sup>. Is there a role for Zero West in working with others to promote and embed culturally diverse narratives of change?
- d) **Pursuing a media strategy** – concerns around media coverage of climate change, including a lack of, or biased, reporting of key findings, events or issues, are well documented. In ‘Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen’, CAT review these concerns and the findings of research which suggest what might be done<sup>40</sup>. They stress the importance of promoting positive stories of local actions to provide people with a sense of agency and social efficacy. This is particularly important if combined with news or warnings of climate change impacts. They point to research identifying seven key principles for visual imagery in climate change communications<sup>41</sup>, and recommend the work of Climate Feedback, a network of climate scientists that provide feedback on inaccurate or biased media coverage<sup>42</sup>. The question arises of whether there is a role for Zero West in seeking to increase the regional media profile of climate change and its solutions, and in challenging inaccuracies or bias in the local media? If so, how could it most effectively promote positive stories of local activities, and of progress across the region? And how should a media strategy take account of the research findings on values-based communication and learning from people and place-based engagement?

---

<sup>38</sup> C Shaw et al, ‘Public engagement with climate change post Brexit: a centre-right perspective’, Climate Outreach, Feb 2017.

<sup>39</sup> Posters created by the Akashi project <https://akashiarchive.wordpress.com/resources/>

<sup>40</sup> See, for example, CAT, ‘Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen’, Sections 6.2 and 7.2.

<sup>41</sup> CAT, ‘Zero Carbon Britain: Making it Happen’, p169.

<sup>42</sup> <http://climatefeedback.org/>.

## A Potential Approach to Identifying and Agreeing the Scope of Zero West Activities

- 9 The initial mapping (above and in the table below) confirms that there could be potential for Zero West to work across geographic scales, with different types of institutions and organisations, and across sectors on linked agendas. The initial mapping goes some way to identifying:
- the range of potential activities that Zero West could in principle become involved in;
  - key stakeholders with a possible interest and role in those activities; and
  - the questions which could be discussed with these stakeholders to enable judgements to be reached about the scope of Zero West activities and how it can add most value.
- 10 The initial mapping suggests that the potential scope of Zero West’s activities could be summarised as follows:
- a) **Information and knowledge exchange:** is there a role for Zero West in providing some sort of information or knowledge hub about all the activities related to decarbonisation that already exist across the West of England, for example, through a dedicated website, newsletter or regular fora? Although there are a number of information sources in the West of England, it is arguable that none of them provides a comprehensive overview or convenient first point of entry into the range of activities that exist.
  - b) **Enabling investment in projects:** there are a number of different types of investment project, including at large scale, widely replicated, across sectors or innovatory (see para 6a). In principle, Zero West could instigate, broker, or facilitate such projects in collaboration with others. This is already part of Zero West aspirations, and initial discussions have taken place about potential projects<sup>43</sup>.
  - c) **Institutional influencing/lobbying:** there are a number of ‘scaling up’ activities of this type that could be undertaken (see paras 6b-e). Zero West could instigate, facilitate, enable or support such activities in collaboration with others. This might entail identifying the need or opportunity, bringing together key parties, and facilitating or undertaking the activity.
  - d) **Grassroots activities:** there are a number of ‘scaling out’ activities that could be undertaken to initiate, enable, support and connect grassroots activities, including working with organisations with linked agendas, working with groups on social justice and decarbonisation, and creating, connecting and supporting community energy groups (see para 7a-e).
  - e) **Public outreach:** there are a number of ‘scaling deep’ activities that could be undertaken to help generate support for, or consent to, the transition to a zero carbon future, including through people and place-based engagement, engaging with centre-right groups, and pursuing a media strategy (see paras 8a-c). Public outreach work is already part of Zero West aspirations, and initial discussions have taken place about potential approaches<sup>44</sup>.
- 11 How to move forward from this point? The following steps are suggested:
- a) Review the initial mapping and suggested potential scope of activity in para 10 (eg ask are there any glaring omissions, or activities that should definitely not be included?).

<sup>43</sup> <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B9VYhGL5uLpsb0RGNDIkVW1kU1k/view>.

<sup>44</sup> <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B9VYhGL5uLpsYmoxZS1PRThxR1E/view>.

- b) Agree the scope of potential activity in principle (ie whether to add 'information and knowledge exchange', 'influencing/lobbying institutions' and 'grassroots activity' to 'enabling investment in projects' and 'public outreach').
- c) Develop a 'working proposition' or 'mission statement' that sets out the scope of potential activity for discussion with key stakeholders (and includes options on the organisational form that Zero West might take?).
- d) Seek feedback from key stakeholders about the potential scope of activity, what they would be prepared to support, and whether they have suggestions for funding and staffing. Key stakeholders should include those already fulfilling key aspects of potential ZW roles (see para 10), for example: the Bristol Green Capital Partnership, CSE, key university contacts, the city council, BEN, Regen SW, Low Carbon SW and Sustrans?
- e) Review and develop the 'working proposition'/'mission statement', organisational options and funding/staffing possibilities in the light of feedback.
- f) Convene a Zero West 'big group' meeting to review, discuss and endorse a way forward.

<b>INITIAL MAPPING OF POTENTIAL ACTIVITIES, KEY QUESTIONS AND STAKEHOLDERS</b>			
<b>Type of activity</b>	<b>Potential activity</b>	<b>Key Questions (to inform identification of how Zero West might add most value)</b>	<b>Stakeholders</b>
<b>Scale up</b>	Enabling investment in projects  (including at large scale, widely replicated, across sectors or innovatory)  (see para 6a)	What are the main foreseeable opportunities for further investment in renewable energy and energy efficiency projects within the city region? What role could Zero West play in enabling further investments in these projects? How could Zero West's role most effectively complement and add to those already active in this area? Which other organisations should be involved in discussions to explore possibilities?	Lead officers in LEP and the unitary authorities Low Carbon SW, Regen SW Mongoose Energy Western Power Distribution Bristol is Open The Energy Systems Catapult Bristol Energy, Ecotricity, Good Energy Cabot Institute UoB, Environment and Sustainability UWE, and the Centre for Energy and Design of Environments, Univ. of Bath
	Influencing the West of England Combined Authority  (see para 6b)	How could WECA contribute most effectively to achieving a zero carbon future? How might WECA build on and complement the existing work of the unitary authorities? What role and influence should WECA have on the LEP's Low Carbon strategy? What lessons might be learnt from the approach of other combined authorities that are taking up the carbon challenge? How might Zero West seek to influence and work most effectively with WECA? Who else should Zero West seek to involve and work with in developing WECA-related activities (across energy, transport, housing, skills etc)?	Lead officers in constituent unitary authorities and the City Office Lead officers in WECA, and other combined authorities Bristol Green Capital Partnership Low Carbon SW/Regen SW Groups working on linked issues eg Sustrans
	Influencing the West of England Local Enterprise Partnership  (see para 6c)	What role and influence should WECA have on the LEP's Low Carbon Strategy? How should Zero West relate to, or seek to influence, the LEP's low carbon programme? Could there be specific projects that Zero West might look to the LEP or its members to develop and support in the future?	Lead officers in the LEP Lead officers in constituent unitary authorities Bristol Green Capital Partnership Low Carbon SW/Regen SW Mongoose Energy

			Groups working on linked issues
	Destabilising fossil fuels (see para 6d)	Are there ways in which Zero West can support divestment campaigns aimed at bodies at the city region or above, or develop or support other initiatives to help overcome carbon lock-in?	Fossil Free Bristol Bristol Friends of the Earth
	Working with trade unions (see para 6e)	Should Zero West seek to involve and work with regional trade unions in the WoE on steps towards a <i>just</i> transition? Could alliances be formed to identify and work on joint initiatives? Is there potential to involve specialist skills centres in the region?	SWTUC, major TU offices in the WoE Gloucestershire Renewable Energy, Engineering & Nuclear Skills (GREEN) Project Construction and Engineering Centre of Excellence (CECE) at Weston College
<b>Scale out</b>	Working with groups with a linked agenda (see para 7a)	To what extent, and in what ways, should Zero West seek to work with local groups already active on transport, buildings, food and other related issues?	Sustrans, Big Lemon CIC Acorn, HAB Housing University Hospitals Bristol NHS Bristol Food Policy Council, Bristol Food Network, Bristol Food Producers Green and black ambassadors
	Working with organisations on decarbonisation and social justice (see para 7b)	Should Zero West seek to build on and spread the sort of initiatives that the Bristol Energy Network has undertaken to help create 'just sustainability' alliances?	Bristol Energy Network Talking Money, Pennywise Acorn Green and black ambassadors
	Creating more community energy groups	Could the experience and expertise within Zero West be used to help establish community energy groups in locales within the West of England where there is currently little energy related activity?	Mongoose Energy CSE Bristol Energy Network

	(see para 7c)	How does this possibility relate to suggestions about people and place-based engagement under potential scaling deep activities (para 8a)?	
	Connecting and supporting community energy groups  (see para 7d)	Is there a role for Zero West in providing an information and learning exchange, in mentoring groups and facilitating mutual aid between groups, or developing a training network? If so, how would this relate to and build on the work of others?	Bristol Energy Network West of England community energy groups Mongoose Energy Regen SW Community Energy England
	Helping to spread grassroots energy innovations  (see para 7e)	Is there a role for Zero West in keeping abreast of promising or successful innovatory ideas and activities from community groups, businesses and local authorities outside the West of England, so that these could be trialed or applied in the West of England? If so, how can this monitoring role be most effectively undertaken?	Mongoose Energy Regen SW Low Carbon SW Community Energy England UoB, UWE, and Univ. of Bath
<b>Scaling deep</b>	Generating consent through people and place-based engagement  (see para 8a)	Is there a role for Zero West in developing a programme of people and place-based engagement (to activate public consent for transition to a zero carbon future)? Or in working with others undertaking such engagement to seek to ensure energy issues are addressed? Could Zero West play a part in developing a network of suitable engagement facilitators? What are the implications for how Zero West partners might go about any substantive renewable energy development in the future?	CSE Bristol Energy Network West of England community energy groups Regen SW
	Generating consent through values-based public outreach  (see para 8b)	How should Zero West take account of research findings on values-based communication when developing its public outreach activities? For example, should Zero West consider developing a programme of talks and discussions with groups whose members might be more inclined to hold centre right or self-enhancing values?	CSE Bristol Energy Network Bristol Friends of the Earth West of England community energy groups
	Generating consent through	Is there a role for Zero West in working with others to promote and embed culturally diverse narratives of change?	Bristol Energy Network Green and black ambassadors

	<p>culturally diverse narratives</p> <p>(see para 8c)</p>		
	<p>Pursuing a media strategy</p> <p>(see para 8d)</p>	<p>Is there is a role for Zero West in seeking to increase the regional media profile of climate change and its solutions, and in challenging inaccuracies or bias?</p> <p>How can it most effectively promote positive stories of local activities, and of progress across the region?</p> <p>How should a media strategy take account of the research findings on values-based communication and learning from place-based engagement?</p>	<p>CSE</p> <p>Fossil Free Bristol</p> <p>Bristol Friends of the Earth</p> <p>Regen SW</p> <p>Low Carbon SW</p> <p>Climate Outreach</p>